EE/Econ 458: HW 7, Due Wednesday Oct 26
A. You solved the following optimization problem in HW6. Using the same system you analyzed in problem 1, shown below, set up the optimal power flow as a linear program. Assume the objective function is the same as used in the example in class when we investigated the case of demand bidding, i.e.,

$$
Z=1307 P_{g 1}+1211 P_{g 2}+1254 P_{g 4}-1300 P_{d 2}-1200 P_{d 3} \text {. Also, assume (as in }
$$

HW6) each generator has a lower limit of 100 MW and an upper limit of 300 MW , which will be (in per unit):
$1 \leq P_{g 1} \leq 3$
$1 \leq P_{g_{2}} \leq 3$
$1 \leq P_{g 3} \leq 3$
and the loads are constrained as follows:
$1 \leq P_{d 2} \leq 2$
$2 \leq P_{d 3} \leq 3$


Problem A1: Provide the objective function and all primal decision and auxiliary variables and dual variables at the optimal solution.
Also identify the settlement, i.e., identify how much each load pays and how much each generator pays.

## Solution:

## Objective: -17.0\$

Primal decision and auxiliary variables:
pg1
1.000000
pg2
2.000000

| pg4 | 1.000000 |
| :--- | :---: |
| pd2 | 2.000000 |
| pd3 | 2.000000 |
| pb1 | -0.013889 |
| theta4 | 0.001389 |
| pb2 | 0.263889 |
| theta2 | -0.026389 |
| pb3 | 0.486111 |
| theta3 | -0.075000 |
| pb4 | 0.763889 |
| pb5 | 0.750000 |
| pb6 | -0.22222 |
| Dual variables: |  |
| c8 | 1211.000000 |
| c9 | 1211.000000 |
| c10 | 1211.000000 |
| c11 | 1211.000000 |
| c12 | -96.000000 |
| c16 | -43.000000 |
| c19 | -89.000000 |
| c20 | -11.000000 |

All other dual prices in the range 1-33 are 0 .
Settlement:
Problem A2: Now constrain the flow on branch 3 to $\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{b} 3}=\mathrm{P}_{23}=0.45$ pu and resolve. Provide the objective function and all solution variables and dual variables at the optimal solution. Also identify the settlement, i.e., identify how much each load pays and how much each generator pays. Finally, compute the congestion charges as the difference between total load payments made and total generator payments received, and using the dual variable of the constrained branch.

## Objective: -11.41\$

Primal decision and auxiliary variables:
pg1 1.000000

| pg2 | 1.870000 |
| :--- | :---: |
| pg4 | 1.130000 |
| pd2 | 2.000000 |
| pd3 | 2.000000 |
| pb1 | -0.050000 |
| theta4 | 0.005000 |
| pb2 | 0.300000 |
| theta2 | -0.030000 |
| pb3 | 0.450000 |
| theta3 | -0.075000 |
| pb4 | 0.800000 |
| pb5 | 0.750000 |
| pb6 | -0.280000 |

All other variables in the range 1-15 are 0 .
Dual variables:

| c1 | 0.000000 |
| :--- | :---: |
| c4 | -154.800000 |
| c8 | 1251.850000 |
| c9 | 1211.000000 |
| c10 | 1290.550000 |
| c11 | 1254.000000 |
| c12 | -55.150000 |
| c19 | -89.000000 |
| c20 | -90.550000 |
| c27 | -154.800000 |

All other dual prices in the range 1-33 are 0 .
Settlement:
B. Use branch-and-bound to solve problems B1 and problem B2. For both problems:
a. Solve them using successive LP-relaxations, where each LPrelaxation is solved using the CPLEX (or Matlab) LP-solver.
b. Solve them using the CPLEX MIP-solver.

## Problem B1:

$\operatorname{Max} \mathrm{z}=5 \mathrm{x} 1+2 \mathrm{x} 2$
s.t. $3 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 12$
$\mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 5$
$\mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2, \geq 0 ; \mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2$ integer
Solution to B1:
a. Using successive LP-relaxations:

First solve as a relaxed LP:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { P1: } \operatorname{Max} \mathrm{z}=5 \mathrm{x} 1+2 \mathrm{x} 2 \\
& \text { s.t. } 3 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 12 \\
& \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 5 \\
& \rightarrow \mathrm{z}^{*}=20.5, \mathrm{x} 1^{*}=3.5, \mathrm{x} 2^{*}=1.5
\end{aligned}
$$

$\mathrm{P} 2: \operatorname{Max} \mathrm{z}=5 \mathrm{x} 1+2 \mathrm{x} 2$
s.t. $3 \times 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 12$
$\mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 5$
$\mathrm{x} 1>=4$
$\mathrm{x} 2 \geq 0$
$z^{*}=20, x 1^{*}=4, x 2^{*}=0$
This solution is integer, so $z^{*}=20$ becomes our best feasible solution.

P3: Max $\mathrm{z}=5 \mathrm{x} 1+2 \mathrm{x} 2$
s.t. $3 \times 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 12$
$\mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 5$
x1<=3
$\mathrm{x} 2 \geq 0$
$z^{*}=19, x 1^{*}=3, x 2^{*}=2$
The objective function value is not as good as that of our best feasible solution and therefore we may stop pursuing this branch.
Let's go back and force x 2 to be integer.

P4: $\operatorname{Max} z=5 x 1+2 x 2$
s.t. $3 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 12$
$\mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 5$
$\mathrm{x} 2 \geq 2$
$\mathrm{x} 1 \geq 0$
$\mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2, \geq 0$
$\mathrm{z}^{*}=19, \mathrm{x} 1^{*}=3, \mathrm{x} 2^{*}=2$
The objective function value is not as good as that of our best feasible solution and therefore we may stop pursuing this branch.

P5: $\operatorname{Max} \mathrm{z}=5 \mathrm{x} 1+2 \mathrm{x} 2$
s.t. $3 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 12$
$\mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 5$
$\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 1$
$\mathrm{x} 1 \geq 0$
$\mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2, \geq 0$
$z^{*}=20.3, x 1^{*}=3.667, \mathrm{x} 2 *=1$
The objective function value is better than that of our best feasible solution, but this solution is not integer. Therefore we need to continue pursuing this branch. Let's force $\mathrm{x} 1=3$.

P6: $\operatorname{Max} \mathrm{z}=5 \mathrm{x} 1+2 \mathrm{x} 2$
s.t. $3 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 12$
$\mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 5$
$\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 1$
$\mathrm{x} 1 \leq 3$
$\mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2, \geq 0$;
$\mathrm{z}^{*}=17, \mathrm{x} 1^{*}=3, \mathrm{x} 2^{*}=1$
The objective function value is not as good as that of our best feasible solution and therefore we may stop pursuing this branch.
Let's force $\mathrm{x} 1=3$.:

P7: $\operatorname{Max} z=5 x 1+2 x 2$
s.t. $3 \times 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 12$
$\mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 5$
$\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 1$
$x 1 \geq 4$
$\mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2, \geq 0$;
$\mathrm{z}^{*}=20, \mathrm{x} 1^{*}=4, \mathrm{x} 2 *=0$
Which is the same solution as that obtained in P2. All possible branches have been considered, therefore the solution to P 2 becomes the solution to the problem: $\mathrm{z}^{*}=20, \mathrm{x} 1^{*}=4, \mathrm{x} 2 *=0$.
b. Using CPLEX MIP solver:
$z^{*}=20, x 1^{*}=4, x 2^{*}=0$.

Problem B2:
$\operatorname{Maxz}=3 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2$
s.t. $5 \mathrm{x} 1+2 \mathrm{x} 2 \leq 10$
$4 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 7$
$x 1, x 2, \geq 0 ; x 2$ integer
Solution to Problem B2:
$\operatorname{Max} \mathrm{z}=3 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2$
s.t. $5 \times 1+2 \times 2 \leq 10$
$4 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 7$
$\mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2, \geq 0 ; \mathrm{x} 2$ integer
a. Using successive LP-relaxations:

First solve as a relaxed LP:
P1: $\operatorname{Max} \mathrm{z}=3 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2$
s.t. $5 \times 1+2 \times 2 \leq 10$
$4 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 7$
$\mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2, \geq 0$;
$\mathrm{z}^{*}=5.667, \mathrm{x} 1^{*}=1.333, \mathrm{x} 2 *=1.667$
Force $\mathrm{x} 1=1$.
P2: $\operatorname{Maxz}=3 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2$
s.t. $5 \times 1+2 \times 2 \leq 10$
$4 \times 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 7$
$\mathrm{x} 1 \leq 1$
$\mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2, \geq 0$;
$\mathrm{z}^{*}=5.5, \mathrm{x} 1 *=1, \mathrm{x} 2 *=2.5$
Force $\times 2=2$.
P3: $\operatorname{Maxz}=3 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2$
s.t. $5 \times 1+2 \times 2 \leq 10$
$4 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 7$
$\mathrm{x} 1 \leq 1$
$\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 2$
$\mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2, \geq 0$;
$\mathrm{z}^{*}=5.0, \mathrm{x} 1^{*}=1, \mathrm{x} 2^{*}=2$
This is a feasible solution (all integer) and therefore $z^{*}=5$ represents our best bound found so far. Now let's branch the other way from P 2 by forcing $\mathrm{x} 2=3$.

P4: $\operatorname{Max} \mathrm{z}=3 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2$
s.t. $5 \times 1+2 \times 2 \leq 10$
$4 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 7$
$\mathrm{x} 1 \leq 1$
$x 2 \geq 3$
$\mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2, \geq 0$;
$\mathrm{z}^{*}=5.4, \mathrm{x} 1^{*}=0.8, \mathrm{x} 2 *=3$
P4 is not feasible but it has a better bound than our best bound so far (of 5.0). So we need to branch further on P4. Force x1 to 1.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { P5: } \operatorname{Max} z=3 x 1+x 2 \\
& \text { s.t. } 5 x 1+2 \times 2 \leq 10 \\
& 4 x 1+x 2 \leq 7 \\
& x 1 \geq 1 \\
& x 2 \geq 3 \\
& x 1, x 2, \geq 0
\end{aligned}
$$

This one is infeasible. Go the other way by forcing x 1 to 0 .
P6: Max z $=3 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2$
s.t. $5 \times 1+2 \times 2 \leq 10$
$4 \mathrm{x} 1+\mathrm{x} 2 \leq 7$
$\mathrm{x} 1 \leq 0$
$x 2 \geq 3$
$\mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2, \geq 0$;
$\mathrm{z}^{*}=5.0, \mathrm{x} 1^{*}=0, \mathrm{x} 2^{*}=5$
This is a feasible solution and it has objective function value equal to our best bound so far (P3).

So now go back to P1 and branch the other way by forcing $\mathrm{x} 1=2$.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { P7: } \operatorname{Max} z=3 \times 1+x 2 \\
& \text { s.t. } 5 \times 1+2 \times 2 \leq 10 \\
& 4 \times 1+x 2 \leq 7 \\
& x 1 \geq 2
\end{aligned}
$$

$\mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2, \geq 0$;
This problem is infeasible, and so we are done. There are two answers:
From P3: $\mathrm{z}^{*}=5.0, \mathrm{x} 1^{*}=1, \mathrm{x} 2^{*}=2$
From P6: $z^{*}=5.0, x 1^{*}=0, x 2^{*}=5$
b. Using MIP solver:

$$
\mathrm{z}^{*}=5, \mathrm{x} 1^{*}=0, \mathrm{x} 2^{*}=5
$$

